


Life changes, why can't your structured settlement change with it?
 Request a FREE quote to get cash now! [CLICK HERE](#)



The Salt Lake Tribune

MONDAY, July 23, 2007

Search

- [Home](#)
- [News](#)
- [Sports](#)
- [Features](#)
- [Entertainment](#)
- [Business](#)
- [Opinion](#)
- [Close-Up](#)
- [Obituaries](#)
- [Classifieds](#)
- [More Sites](#)
- [Help Desk](#)

More Utah News

- Pioneer Day is big holiday in little Mona
- No more 'mayors'? Lawmakers explore options
- Cedar Hills man arrested after giving dog ibuprofen
- Mayor and former trooper to be tried on assault charge
- Ex-Catholic priest from Utah to stay in prison for molesting boy
- Automobile homicide charges for driver in crash that killed two
- West Jordan Council mulls citizen vote on proposed new school district
- Bryce Canyon City is born
- Detectives suspect homicide in death of baby found in orchard last fall
- Utah soldier will win new home
- Washington Co. bans fireworks
- A former Hatch aide, U.S. Attorney in DC is in a tight spot
- Firefighters counterattack at SW Utah's Dakota Hill Complex blaze
- Police: Man's nose bitten off in fight
- Highland latest city to consider changing park strip rules
- Stocks bounce higher following buyout news, earnings reports
- Motorist killed Sunday was Salt Lake City woman
- Deployment dolls help families cope with absent G.I.s
- Mesh ramps save critters from water trough death
- Panel says growing SW Utah needs \$1.5b in transportation work
- Utah forecast: Hot, maybe a little wet
- Rolly: Utah War alarm to be re-enacted
- No charges to be filed in teen's freezing death
- Storms may be a mixed blessing
- 18,500 acres charred
- Your Week
- Desert dust quickens snowmelt in West's mountains, study says
- Blaze ignites residents' desire for family fire plans

- del.icio.us
- Digg
- Reddit
- YahooMyWeb
- Google
- What's this?

[Print](#) [Email](#)

Judge rebuffs Kane, Garfield claims on Grand Staircase-Escalante roads

By **Patty Henetz**
 The Salt Lake Tribune

Article Last Updated: 07/03/2007 08:15:47 AM MDT

A federal judge has dismissed a lawsuit over land use in the Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument, ruling Kane and Garfield counties can neither claim ownership of roads that crisscross the monument's 1.8 million acres nor expect the U.S. Bureau of Land Management to do so for them.

That's because the BLM doesn't have the power to make binding decisions on road ownership, U.S. District Judge Bruce Jenkins ruled Friday. Further, the counties haven't yet proved ownership under required "quiet title" action, the judge said, rendering their lawsuit premature.

The lawsuit filed last year affects the monument President Clinton created in 1996 under the federal Antiquities Act. It also has implications for the ongoing battle over mechanized access to wilderness-potential areas in Utah that has pitted environmental organizations seeking to conserve roadless areas against local officials who fear wilderness designation will harm their economies.

The counties "tried to overturn all the protections limiting . . . off-highway vehicle travel [in the monument] based on unsupported allegations without proof there were a bunch of highways out there, somewhere," Earthjustice attorney Ted Zukoski said Monday. "The judge said they have to prove each and every road."

Zukoski represented the Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance, which intervened as a defendant in the case along with the National Trust for Historic Preservation, the Sierra Club and the Wilderness Society. The counties filed the lawsuit against the U.S. Department of the Interior and the BLM, as well as agency principals.

Jenkins' ruling allows the counties to file an amended complaint within 20 days.

Kane County Commissioner Mark Habbeshaw said Monday he hadn't spoken to his county's attorney nor read the ruling, but expected a return to court either with an amended claim or an appeal.

Revised Statute 2477 is a Civil War-era mining law that allowed counties and cities to construct roads across federal land. The open-ended language was repealed three decades ago, but existing rights of way were grandfathered in.

Two years ago the 10th U.S. Circuit Court of Appeals ruled state laws dictate how the road claims are to be decided. In Utah, the law says "existing"

roads are those that had 10 years of continuous use and county maintenance before 1976. Continuous-use claims under quiet title actions now must be decided road by road in federal court.

But to litigate every road claim "would be overwhelmingly expensive to everybody, to us, to the federal court," Habbeshaw said. The county has 1,000 roads and each would cost at least \$100,000 to take to court, he added.

Utah already has spent \$12 million gathering evidence to help the counties prove their claims. "We don't have one road to show for that," Habbeshaw said.

Jenkins also dismissed the counties' claims they would be harmed if the monument plan doesn't loosen its restrictions on water diversions for agriculture or commercial use. The judge said the BLM has yet to act on a Kane County water-district request the agency heard in January, so the claim is premature.

Advertisement



[Return to Top](#)

To Advertise Online

- Button Ads
- Banner Ads
- Tower Ads
- and more!

Doing whatever it takes...

 Murray | Sandy

Save up to 75% on Last-Minute Cruises



Best Price Guarantee. GO!

VACATIONS ToGo.com

- Homeowners leery of proposed Bonneville Shoreline Trail extension
- For the Record
- Holiday: What's open or closed?
- Jewel's ethereal charm shines with Symphony
- Wildfires update: Salt Creek blaze tops 21,300 acres as crews dig in to defend homes
- Program grows as building industry booms
- Home defense shootings: Questions arise after citizen charged but cop is not
- Wildfire has Box Elder ranchers scrambling to save herds, homes
- Lawmakers to discuss 1872 law reform

RECENT COMMENTS:

7/5/2007 9:28:00 AM -- Could anything be more absurd than this boondoggle? Habbeshaw and co. plan to be in court again, either with an amended... [\[MORE\]](#)

7/4/2007 12:47:00 AM -- It is getting to a point anymore that if they dont allow it to be a road, we will make it continue to exist as a road. What Daryl... [\[MORE\]](#)

7/3/2007 6:54:00 PM -- Getting these cow trails declared roads gives the counties the rights of way along the roads as well. Then they can give land... [\[MORE\]](#)

[READ ALL 6 COMMENTS](#) | [POST A COMMENT](#) | [REGISTER](#) | [TRIBUTALK.COM](#)

Was this article worthwhile?



+8

18 VOTES

JULY 6-7

Pops Concert
July 6-7

Landscape Art Show
July 7-24

CLICK HERE FOR MORE INFO



Sponsored Links

[Moving Companies](#)
[Patio & Deck Covers](#)
[Nanny Agency Great AuPair](#)
[1 Carat Diamond Pendants](#)

[Gift Ideas](#)
[Moving](#)
[World Travel Guide](#)
[Si-Mexico Hotels Resorts](#)

[Cell Phone Plans](#)
[FREE Myspace Layouts, MYSPACE](#)
[Compare Prices](#)
[Information Network](#)

[Gift Baskets & Gourmet Food](#)
[Isagenix](#)
[Kars4Kids](#)
[Moving Companies](#)



[Privacy Policy](#) | [MNG Corporate Site Map](#) | [Copyright](#)